

| | | CLOUDY | COSTAR | MEUDON | UCL_PDR | KOSMA-tau | HTBKW | BENSCH | Aikawa | Leiden | Lee96mod | Sternberg | Meijerink |
|------------------|---|--------|--------|--------|---------|-----------|-------|--------|--------|--------|----------|-----------|-----------|
| GEOMETRY | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | <i>spherical</i> | ☐ | | | | ☐ | | ☐ | | | | | |
| | <i>plane-parallel, finite</i> | ☐ | | ☐ | | | ☐ | | | ☐ | | | |
| | <i>plane-parallel, semi-infinite</i> | ☐ | | ☐ | ☐ | | ☐ | | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ |
| | <i>circumstellar disc</i> | ☐ | ☐ | | | | | | | | | | |
| | <i>ensemble of clouds</i> | | | | | ☐ | | ☐ | | | | | |
| DENSITY | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | <i>homogeneous</i> | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ |
| | <i>density-law</i> | ☐ | | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ |
| | <i>time dependant</i> | ☐ | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | <i>velocity field</i> | ☐ | | | | ☐ | | ☐ | | | | | |
| | <i>v = const</i> | ☐ | | | | ☐ | | ☐ | | | | | |
| | <i>v = v(r,...)</i> | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| RADIATION | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | <i>isotropic radiation field</i> | | | ☐ | | ☐ | | ☐ | | | | | |
| | <i>uni-directional radiation field</i> | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | | ☐ | | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ |
| | <i>combination of isotropic+illuminating star</i> | | | ☐ | | | | | | | | | |
| | <i>Habing field</i> | ☐ | | | ☐ | | ☐ | | | ☐ | | | ☐ |
| | <i>Draine field</i> | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | | ☐ | | ☐ | |
| | <i>optional star</i> | ☐ | | ☐ | | | | | | | | | |
| | <i>detailed SED</i> | ☐ | | ☐ | | | | | | | | | |
| | <i>other</i> | | | | | | | | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | | |
| | <i>external radiation source</i> | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ |
| | <i>internal radiation source</i> | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| CHEMISTRY | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | <i>stationary chemistry</i> | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | | ☐ | | ☐ | ☐ |
| | <i>time-dependant chemistry</i> | | | | ☐ | | | | ☐ | | ☐ | | |
| | <i>advection flow</i> | ☐ | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | <i>UMIST 95</i> | | | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | | | | ☐ | | ☐ | ☐ |

| | CLOUDY | COSTAR | MEUDON | UCL_PDR | KOSMA-tau | HTBKW | BENSCH | Aikawa | Leiden | Lee96mod | Sternberg | Meijerink |
|---|--------|--------|--------|---------|-----------|-------|--------|--------|--------|----------|-----------|-----------|
| <i>UMIST 99</i> | | | | | | ☒ | ☒ | | | | ☒ | |
| <i>NSM</i> | | | ☒ | | | | | ☒ | | ☒ | | |
| <i>other database</i> | ☒ | ☒ | ☒ | | ☒ | | ☒ | | ☒ | | ☒ | |
| <i>fixed number of species</i> | ☒ | ☒ | | ☒ | | ☒ | | ☒ | | ☒ | ☒ | |
| <i>variable number of species</i> | | | ☒ | | ☒ | | ☒ | | ☒ | | | ☒ |
| <i># of species</i> | 33 | 48 | | 128 | | 46 | | 577 | | 419 | 78 | |
| <i>PAH's included</i> | ☒ | | ☒ | ☒ | | ☒ | ☒ | | ☒ | | | ☒ |
| <i>depletion on ice/grains included</i> | ☒ | ☒ | ☒ | ☒ | | | | ☒ | | | | |
| <i>H2 formation on grains</i> | ☒ | ☒ | ☒ | ☒ | ☒ | ☒ | ☒ | ☒ | ☒ | ☒ | ☒ | ☒ |
| <i>formation of other molecules on grains</i> | | | ☒ | ☒ | | | | ☒ | | | | |
| <i>desorption mechanisms included</i> | | ☒ | ☒ | | | | | ☒ | | | | |
| <i>thermal desorption</i> | | ☒ | | | | | | | | | | |
| <i>photoevaporation</i> | | | ☒ | | | | | | | | | |
| <i>CR spot heating</i> | | | ☒ | | | | | ☒ | | | | |
| <i>grain-grain collisions</i> | | | ☒ | | | | | | | | | |
| <i>metallicity included</i> | ☒ | ☒ | ☒ | ☒ | ☒ | ☒ | ☒ | | ☒ | | ☒ | |
| ISOTOPOMERS | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| <i>13C</i> | ☒ | | ☒ | | ☒ | | ☒ | | ☒ | | | |
| <i>17O</i> | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| <i>18O</i> | | | ☒ | | ☒ | | ☒ | | ☒ | | | |
| <i>D</i> | ☒ | | ☒ | | | | | ☒ | ☒ | | | |
| THERMAL BALANCE | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| <i>fixed temperature</i> | ☒ | | ☒ | | ☒ | | ☒ | | | ☒ | ☒ | |
| <i>temperature determined from energy balance</i> | ☒ | ☒ | ☒ | ☒ | ☒ | ☒ | ☒ | ☒ | ☒ | | ☒ | ☒ |
| COOLING | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| <i>gas-grain cooling</i> | ☒ | ☒ | ☒ | ☒ | ☒ | ☒ | ☒ | ☒ | ☒ | | ☒ | ☒ |

| | | CLOUDY | COSTAR | MEUDON | UCL_PDR | KOSMA-tau | HTBKW | BENSCH | Aikawa | Leiden | Lee96mod | Sternberg | Meijerink |
|--------------------------------------|---------------------------------------|--------|--------|--------|---------|-----------|-------|--------|--------|--------|----------|-----------|-----------|
| | turbulence heating | ☐ | | | ☐ | | | | | | | | |
| | chemical balance | | | ☐ | | | | | | ☐ | | | |
| UV TRANSFER | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | solved selfconsistently | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | | ☐ | | ☐ | ☐ |
| | simple exponential attenuation | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | | ☐ |
| | biexponential attenuation | | ☐ | | | | | | | | | ☐ | |
| | full RT in lines | | | ☐ | | | | | | | | | |
| DUST | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | treatment of rad. transfer | ☐ | | ☐ | | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | | ☐ | | ☐ | |
| | grain size distribution | ☐ | | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | | ☐ | | | | ☐ | ☐ |
| | extinction/scattering law | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | |
| | albedo | ☐ | | ☐ | ☐ | | | | | ☐ | | | |
| | scattering law | ☐ | | ☐ | ☐ | | | | | ☐ | | | |
| H2 SHIELDING | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | shielding factors | ☐ | ☐ | | | | ☐ | | ☐ | | ☐ | | |
| | single line | ☐ | | | ☐ | | | | | | | | ☐ |
| | detailed solution | ☐ | | ☐ | | ☐ | | ☐ | | ☐ | | ☐ | |
| CO SHIELDING | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | shielding factors | | ☐ | | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | |
| | single line | ☐ | | | | | | | | ☐ | | | ☐ |
| | detailed solution | | | ☐ | | | | | | ☐ | | | |
| | isotope selective photodissociation | | | ☐ | | ☐ | | ☐ | | ☐ | | | |
| UV PROFILE FUNCTION | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | Gaussian | | | | ☐ | | ☐ | | | | | | |
| | Voigt | ☐ | | ☐ | | | | | | ☐ | | ☐ | |
| | Box | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | other | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| RAD TRANSFER IN COOLING LINES | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | escape probability | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | | ☐ | ☐ |
| | other | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | IR pumping | ☐ | ☐ | | ☐ | | ☐ | | | ☐ | | | |
| OBSERVATIONAL LINES | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | selfconsistent treatment with cooling | ☐ | | | ☐ | | | | | | | | |
| | escape probability | ☐ | | | | | ☐ | | ☐ | ☐ | | ☐ | ☐ |

| | CLOUDY | COSTAR | MEUDON | UCL_PDR | KOSMA-tau | HTBKW | BENSCH | Aikawa | Leiden | Lee96mod | Sternberg | Meijerink |
|--|--------|--------|--------|---------|-----------|-------|--------|--------|--------|----------|-----------|-----------|
| <i>other</i> | | | ☐ | | ☐ | | ☐ | | | | | |
| <i>H2</i> | ☐ | | ☐ | | | | | | | | | |
| <i>HD</i> | | | ☐ | | | | | | | | | |
| <i>I2CO</i> | ☐ | | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | | | | |
| <i>I3CO</i> | ☐ | | ☐ | | ☐ | | | | | | | |
| <i>C18O</i> | | | ☐ | | ☐ | | | | | | | |
| <i>I3C18O</i> | | | ☐ | | ☐ | | | | | | | |
| <i>O</i> | ☐ | | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | | ☐ | ☐ |
| <i>C+</i> | ☐ | | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | | ☐ | ☐ |
| <i>CI</i> | ☐ | | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | | ☐ | ☐ |
| <i>Si+</i> | ☐ | | ☐ | | | ☐ | | | | | | |
| <i>CS</i> | | | ☐ | | | | | | | | | |
| <i>H2O</i> | | | | | | ☐ | | | | | | |
| <i>H218O</i> | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| <i>HCO+</i> | | | ☐ | | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | | | | | |
| <i>OH</i> | | | | | | ☐ | | | | | | |
| <i>SiI</i> | ☐ | | | | | ☐ | | | | | | |
| <i>SI,SII</i> | ☐ | | | | | ☐ | | | | | | |
| <i>FeI, FeII</i> | ☐ | | | | | ☐ | | | | | | |
| COMPUTED LINE PROPERTIES | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| <i>resolved line profile</i> | | | ☐ | | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | | ☐ | | | |
| <i>continuum rad./rad transfer in UV</i> | ☐ | | ☐ | | | | | | | | | |
| <i>line center intensities</i> | ☐ | | ☐ | | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | | | | | |
| <i>line integrated intensities</i> | ☐ | | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | | ☐ | | | ☐ |
| <i>optical depths</i> | ☐ | | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | | ☐ | | | |
| <i>Gaussian line profile</i> | ☐ | | ☐ | | ☐ | ☐ | ☐ | | ☐ | | | |
| <i>box line profile</i> | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| <i>turbulence included</i> | ☐ | | ☐ | | ☐ | | ☐ | | | | | |
| COLLISIONS | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| <i>H-H</i> | ☐ | | | | | ☐ | | | | | ☐ | |
| <i>H2-H</i> | ☐ | | ☐ | ☐ | | ☐ | | | ☐ | | ☐ | |
| <i>H2 - H+</i> | ☐ | | ☐ | | | | | | | | ☐ | |
| <i>H2 - e</i> | ☐ | | | | | ☐ | | | | | ☐ | |

| | CLOUDY | COSTAR | MEUDON | UCL_PDR | KOSMA-tau | HTBKW | BENSCH | Aikawa | Leiden | Lee96mod | Sternberg | Meijerink |
|-------------|--------|--------|--------|---------|-----------|-------|--------|--------|--------|----------|-----------|-----------|
| H2 - H2 | ◀ | | ◀ | | | ◀ | | | ◀ | | ◀ | |
| CO-H | ◀ | ◀ | ◀ | ◀ | | ◀ | | | ◀ | | | ◀ |
| CO-H2 | ◀ | ◀ | | ◀ | ◀ | ◀ | | | ◀ | | | ◀ |
| CO-e | ◀ | ◀ | | ◀ | ◀ | | | | | | | ◀ |
| C-H | | ◀ | | ◀ | ◀ | ◀ | | | ◀ | | ◀ | |
| C-H2 | | ◀ | | ◀ | ◀ | ◀ | | | ◀ | | | |
| C-e | ◀ | | | ◀ | | | | | | | | |
| C - H2O | ◀ | | | | | | | | | | | |
| C+ - H | ◀ | ◀ | ◀ | ◀ | | ◀ | | | ◀ | | | |
| C+ - H2 | ◀ | ◀ | ◀ | ◀ | ◀ | ◀ | | | ◀ | | | ◀ |
| C+ - e | ◀ | ◀ | | ◀ | ◀ | ◀ | | | ◀ | | | |
| OI - H | ◀ | ◀ | ◀ | ◀ | ◀ | ◀ | | | ◀ | | ◀ | |
| OI - H2 | ◀ | ◀ | ◀ | ◀ | ◀ | ◀ | | | ◀ | | ◀ | ◀ |
| OI - H+ | ◀ | | | ◀ | | ◀ | | | ◀ | | | |
| OI - e | ◀ | ◀ | | ◀ | | ◀ | | | | | | |
| OH - H | ◀ | | | | | | | | | | | |
| OH - He | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| OH - H2 | ◀ | | | | ◀ | ◀ | | | | | | |
| H - H | ◀ | | | | | | | | | | | |
| e - H2O | ◀ | | | | | | | | | | | |
| H - H2O | ◀ | | | | | | | | | | | |
| H2 - H2O | | | | | | ◀ | | | | | | |
| O - H2O | ◀ | | | | | | | | | | | |
| dust - H/H2 | ◀ | | | | | ◀ | | | | | | |
| dust-any | ◀ | | | | | | | | | | | |
| CO - He | | | ◀ | ◀ | | | | | | | | |
| O - He | ◀ | | | ◀ | | | | | | | | |
| C - He | | | | ◀ | | | | | | | | |
| Si+ - H | ◀ | | ◀ | | | | | | | | | |
| HD - H | | | ◀ | | | | | | | | | |
| HD - H2 | | | ◀ | | | | | | | | | |
| PAH-any | ◀ | | | | | ◀ | | | | | | |

OUTPUT

| | CLOUDY | COSTAR | MEUDON | UCL_PDR | KOSMA-tau | HTBKW | BENSCH | Aikawa | Leiden | Lee96mod | Sternberg | Meijerink |
|---|--------|--------|--------|---------|-----------|-------|--------|--------|--------|----------|-----------|-----------|
| abundance profile over (Av/depth) | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ |
| column density over (Av/depth) | ✓ | | ✓ | | ✓ | | ✓ | | | | ✓ | |
| temperature profile over (Av/depth) | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | | | ✓ | ✓ |
| emitted intensities | ✓ | | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | ✓ | | ✓ | | | ✓ |
| opacities at line center | | | ✓ | | ✓ | ✓ | | ✓ | | | | |
| heating and cooling rates over (Av/depth) | ✓ | | ✓ | | ✓ | | ✓ | | | | ✓ | |
| chemical rates over (Av/depth) | | | ✓ | | ✓ | | ✓ | | | | ✓ | |
| excitation diagram of H2 | ✓ | | ✓ | | | | | | | | | |

Model Name

CLOUDY

COSTAR

MEUDON

UCL_PDR

KOSMA-tau

HTBKW

BENSCH

AIKAWA

LEIDEN

Lee96mod

Sternberg

Meijerink

Authors

Gary J. Ferland, Peter van Hoof, Nick P. Abel, Gargi Shaw

I. Kamp, F. Bertoldi, G.-J. van Zadelhoff

J. Le Bourlot, E. Roueff, F. Le Petit

S. Viti, Wing-Fai Thi, Tom Bell

A.Sternberg, J. Stutzki, H. Störzer, B. Köster, M. Zielinsky, U. Leuenhagen, S.Jeyakumar, M.Röllig

D. Hollenbach, A.G.G.M. Tielens, M.G. Burton, M.J. Kaufman, M.G. Wolfire

H. Störzer, B. Köster, M. Zielinsky, U. Leuenhagen, S.Jeyakumar, F. Bensch

H.-H. Lee, E. Herbst, G. Pineau des Forets, J. Le Bourlot, Y. Aikawa, N. Kuboi

J. Black, E. van Dishoeck

H.-H. Lee, E. Herbst, G. Pineau des Forets, E. Roueff, J. Le Bourlot

A.Sternberg

R.Meijerink, M.Spaans